FM REVIEW 2018 40 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO THE EDITOR:

COMMENTS TO THE AUTHOR: Thank for this strikingly well-written essay, it was truly a joy to read. You have a remarkable facility with language that brings this encounter to vivid life. The patient, the medical student, and the doctor all emerge as authentic, complicated people in only a few words. The title is lovely, poignant, tantalizing, and reminded me of "When Breath Becomes Air."

I recommend that you consider only a few very minor edits and word changes (see attached file). In particular, both reviewer 2 and I felt the phrase about the lovers' might be a little overwritten. A few other minor suggestions are made to clarify the text. Generally speaking, however, this is an almost perfect essay.

COMMENTS TO THE EDITOR II: The author has made minor recommended changes to what was already a beautifully crafted essay. It is quite beautiful, and I enthusiastically recommend accepting it for publication.

Sam: Please note pg 2, line 42, the author writes the past tense of the verb to lie as "laid". I know this is an increasingly accepted usage, but I would prefer if it was corrected to "lay." I requested that the author make this change, but she did not. I think she was confused about what I was referring to. If possible, I think the final copy should reflect what I believe is still the grammatically correct form.

COMMENTS TO THE AUTHOR II: Thank you so much for these minor changes that nevertheless polish this beautifully crafted piece. I especially appreciated the change on p.3, line 42 from "this kind of thing" to "finding where the sound goes," an exquisite explication of the essay's title. Altogether, this will make a poignant and moving addition to this journal.